THE INFLUENCE OF INTERNATIONAL LAW ON MUNICIPAL LEGAL SYSTEMS IN ASEAN

Regina Cyrilla Candra

1Faculty of Law, President University, Indonesia. E-mail: regina.candra@student.president.ac.id

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Article</th>
<th>Abstract</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ASEAN, Compliance, International law,</td>
<td>The paper explores the influence of international law on ASEAN member states' municipal legal systems, with a focus on treaty incorporation, customary international law, and involvement with international jurisprudence and institutions. It emphasizes the challenges that ASEAN faces, such as fragmentation, a lack of public awareness, and varying political conditions, which interfere with unified implementation of international law. Despite these challenges, mutual dependence and aspirations for regional integration demands continuous compliance to international law. The ASEAN Charter plays an essential role in strengthening the region's legal framework. Furthermore, efforts to address fragmentation, raise public awareness, and increase stronger political commitment to international law are essential for an ASEAN region that is stable, honors human rights, and is fully integrated.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Article History
Received: Jan., 19, 2024; Reviewed: Jan., 23, 2024; Accepted: Jan., 26, 2024; Published: Feb, 10, 2024
1. INTRODUCTION

The Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN) was established on 8 August 1967, unified by mutual interests and interdependence among the member states which are bound by geography, common objectives and shared destiny. Brunei Darussalam, the Kingdom of Cambodia, the Republic of Indonesia, the Lao People's Democratic Republic, Malaysia, the Union of Myanmar, the Republic of the Philippines, the Republic of Singapore, the Kingdom of Thailand and the Socialist Republic of Viet Nam are the member states of ASEAN.¹

ASEAN, as a regional organization, does own several legal frameworks to guide the continuity of its enforcement. The ASEAN Charter serves as the main constitution. This constitution, which was adopted in 2007, set out the organization's fundamental principles, goals, and organizational framework. It strengthens the legal system by offering a more coherent basis for making decisions and carrying them out.²

International law serves a valuable influence in ASEAN’s legal framework, shaping municipal legal systems to promote regional integration, human rights, economic cooperation, and responses to transnational affairs. While challenges exist, the increasing interconnectedness necessitates continued engagement with international law for a stable and rights-respecting ASEAN region.³ This paper will explore to what extent and in what ways does international law influence domestic legal systems in ASEAN.

2. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The research used "Normative Juridical Legal Research" in accordance with Soerjono Soekanto's opinion that legal research is carried out by examining secondary materials or library materials or library legal research, through searching for books, laws, literature, and other legal materials.⁴

² ibid
3. ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION

3.1 International Law’s Influence on ASEAN Countries

3.1.1 Treaties and Conventions

There are several mechanisms when it comes to the action of incorporating international treaties and conventions into municipal law, depending on the legal systems and approaches of each state. Same goes with how the member states of ASEAN ratified ASEAN treaties into their law.

In a direct incorporation mechanism, states automatically incorporate ratified treaties into their municipal legal systems without further action. Singapore is a country that generally adopts the direct incorporation approach. Other states require specific legislation to interpret the treaty into municipal law, outlining its application and enforcement mechanisms.

This approach is practiced in Indonesia, which typically requires specific legislation as an interpretation of the treaty.

States that practice dualist approach maintain a distinction between international and domestic law, requiring specific legislation to give effect to treaty provisions.

Thailand practices the dualistic approach which allows both mechanisms to be applied.

---

8 Odile Ammann, (n.6).
Some factors that influence the various approaches lie in the state’s constitution, where some constitutions mandate specific procedures for treaty incorporation, the state’s legal system, for instance, civil law systems often favor direct incorporation, while common law systems might prefer transformation, and the state’s political considerations, where regional political factors can influence the chosen approach.\(^\text{10}\)

The successful implementation of ASEAN treaties and conventions in promoting regional cooperation and norms depend on the various approaches that member states adopt to integrate them into their national legal frameworks. It is necessary to address issues such as harmonization and implementation gaps in order to guarantee the complete effectiveness of these instruments.

The municipal laws of member states are significantly influenced by ASEAN treaties, which shape a variety of fields including trade, the environment, and the protection of human rights. Some examples include The ASEAN Human Rights Declaration. While it does not act as a legally binding treaty, it sets aspirational standards and encourages member states to review and harmonize their municipal laws with the principles of human rights.\(^\text{11}\)

In supporting environmental protection, ASEAN established The ASEAN Agreement on Transboundary Haze Pollution. This agreement has led to the implementation of national laws regulating land use, fire management, and pollution control to address transboundary environmental issues.\(^\text{12}\)

Not only the ASEAN treaty, the incorporation of international treaties also influenced the ASEAN member states’ municipal law. The Paris Agreement, ratified by all member states of ASEAN, has influenced national legislation related to climate change mitigation and adaptation strategies.\(^\text{13}\)

The Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (CAT), is a United Nations treaty which ASEAN member states are a part of, has led to the adoption of national anti-torture legislation and the establishment of preventive mechanisms.\(^\text{14}\)

---


The impact of ASEAN and international treaties on municipal legislation varies depending on factors like level of commitment, since binding treaties have a stronger influence than non-binding instruments. Second is domestic political context, national political will and capacity to implement treaty obligations play a crucial role. Lastly, the legal systems. Different legal systems may require varying degrees of legislative adjustments to comply with treaties.  

ASEAN faces many obstacles in its efforts to carry out treaties and promote regional integration. These include the need to adjust to a new kind of regionalism that involves a wider range of stakeholders, policy inconsistencies, political and security conflicts, financial inequalities, and problems with legal integration. The ASEAN Charter is a start in the right direction, but there are still many barriers in the way of true treaty implementation and further integration. 

3.1.2 Customary International Law

Just like international treaties and conventions, the recognition and application of customary international law principles in ASEAN countries' municipal legal systems vary depending on the country's constitutional and legal orders, socio-political interests, and priorities. 

Certain ASEAN member states, such as Vietnam, adopt a monist approach and integrate Customary International Law directly into their legal systems, while other member states, like Thailand, maintain a separation of powers and require special legislation to apply Customary International Law. 

In monitoring state practice and acceptance as evidence of Customary International Law principles, courts are essential because they can apply the principles directly to disputes or interpret municipal law in a way that takes them into consideration. Nevertheless, difficulties like judicial capacity limitations, fragmentation, and creating a balance between national interests lead to a challenge. Regardless of these differences, ASEAN nations

---

19 OHCHR, (n.9).
recognize the importance of Customary International Law, and efforts that address
disintegration, improve judicial capability, and promote regional cooperation can help
ensure that these principles are applied more consistently and successfully throughout the
region.\textsuperscript{20}

Customary International Law, despite its challenges, plays a huge influence in shaping
municipal legal developments in ASEAN countries in various aspects like international
relations, governance, and human rights. Law of the sea, for instance, has been incorporated
by numerous ASEAN member states into their national law, as a maritime regulation,
governing fisheries, freedom of navigation, Exclusive Economic Zone, and more.

3.1.3 International Jurisprudence and Institutions

International jurisprudence and institutions have a significant impact on domestic
courts in ASEAN member countries. Regional courts play an important role in interpreting
and implementing international law, particularly by giving authoritative decisions in
disputed conflicts.\textsuperscript{21}

The willingness of regional courts to engage with international law varies based on the
nature of the legal rule at the certain issue, whether horizontal (state-to-state), vertical (state-
to-private party), or transnational (private-to-private).\textsuperscript{22}

While some regional courts may refuse in enforcing international jurisprudence, the
precedential value of international judgments can ensure equal treatment before the law and
promote unified interpretation and application of international law.\textsuperscript{23}

ASEAN Intergovernmental Commission on Human Rights (AICHR), the integral part
of ASEAN, is a concrete application on how international institutions can play a significant
role in influencing municipal legal practices in ASEAN member states. The essence of
AICHR is promoting and protecting human rights in the region, and its recommendations
and decisions can influence regional legal practices of ASEAN member states.\textsuperscript{24}

The AICHR has issued recommendations on the rights of women and children, the
rights of persons with disabilities, and the protection of migrant workers.\textsuperscript{25}

\textsuperscript{20} P Tangsubkul & FL Fung-wai, 'The New Law of the Sea and Development in Southeast Asia', 23(7)
\textsuperscript{21} David Sloss & Michael Van Alstine, International Law in Domestic Courts Research Handbook on the
\textsuperscript{22} Petrova Georgieva, Virdzhiniya. ‘Hierarchy between Domestic and International Tribunals: Utopia or
\textsuperscript{23} ibid.
\textsuperscript{24} White L.A., ‘Do International Organizations Influence Domestic Policy Outcomes in OECD Countries?’,
Macmillan, Cham.
\textsuperscript{25} David Sloss & Michael Van Alstine, (n.21).
3.2 Comparative Analysis across ASEAN Member States

All member states are bound by ASEAN law, which includes treaties and agreements establishing regional norms and obligations. However, there is an increasing engagement with international law across the region, driven by factors like globalization and regional integration.²⁶

ASEAN member states take different approaches to international law. Some countries, such as Indonesia and the Philippines, embrace democracy and stick to some global human rights standards, whereas others, such as Singapore, Malaysia, and Thailand, follow the law but are hesitant to adopt global standards, particularly in terms of civil and political rights. Furthermore, some countries, such as Cambodia, Laos, Myanmar, Vietnam, and Brunei, indicate slow progress in human rights compliance and have been less proactive in adhering to global standards and transparency/monitoring requirements.²⁷

When it comes to approaches to incorporate and implement international law in ASEAN member states’ municipal law, the diversity can contribute to some challenges. First is fragmentation. The diverse approaches create inconsistency in how international law is applied across the region. Second, lack of awareness. Limited public awareness and understanding of international law can limit the effective implementation of it. Lastly, political will. Political considerations can sometimes undermine the commitment to international legal obligations.²⁸

When it comes to understanding the reason behind the diverse approaches of international law application in ASEAN member states’ municipal law despite the common objectives and the bond by geography, there are several factors we need to take notes of. The factors include historical experience, colonialism, unequal treaties, and post-war experiences, which have increased the perception that international law is of questionable value and can be used for instrumental purposes.²⁹

Nevertheless, The ASEAN Charter asserts the organization's legal personality and

plays a crucial role in shaping regional agreements and ensuring compliance with international obligations.\textsuperscript{30}

4. CONCLUSION

There are various ways and extents to which international law influences ASEAN member states' municipal legal systems. International law has a significant impact on national legislation and legal practices in the region, particularly in trade, the environment, and human rights. Treaties, customary international law, and the decisions and recommendations of international courts and institutions are all examples of mechanisms that demonstrate this influence.

However, the extent of influence varies considerably between member states due to factors such as different approaches to treaty incorporation, the recognition and application of customary international law, and engagement with international jurisprudence and institutions. Furthermore, challenges such as fragmentation, a lack of public awareness, and varying political conditions will limit the unified and effective implementation of international law throughout ASEAN.

Despite these challenges, the growing mutual dependence and shared aspirations for regional integration call for continuous compliance with international law. The ASEAN Charter is an essential step toward strengthening the region's legal framework and encouraging compliance with international obligations. Moving forward, efforts to decrease fragmentation, raise public awareness, and develop a stronger political commitment to international law will be essential in ensuring a more stable, rights-respecting, and integrated ASEAN region.

\textsuperscript{30} Haneefa Adzka, ‘ASEAN as a Subject of International Law: Its Role in the Formation of International Treaties.’ (2022) Journal ASEAN Dynamics and Beyond, 3(2), 110.
REFERENCES

Journal/Article


Pratomo, Eddy (2009), ‘Prospect and Challenges of International Law in ASEAN and in Indonesia ASEAN Charter Aftermath: International Treaty Perspective’, IUSTUM Journal of International Law


United Nations, Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, 1465 UNTS 85. Retrieved February 24, 2024, from https://www.ohchr.org/sites/default/files/cat.pdf


Petrova Georgieva, Virdzhiniya. ‘Hierarchy between Domestic and International Tribunals: Utopia or Near Future?’ Anuario Colombiano de Derecho Internacional (acdi), 14 (2021)


Haneefa Adzka, ‘ASEAN as a Subject of International Law: Its Role in the Formation of International Treaties.’ ‘(2022) Journal ASEAN Dynamics and Beyond