**Understanding Xinjiang from a Chinese Nationalist’s Perspective**

**Harryanto Aryodiguno, Ph.D**

**International Relations Study Programs**

**President University, Indonesia**

This paper focuses on the Xinjiang conflict with the central government as one of the conflicts that have sparked the world's attention, especially in western countries. Western media spend their most effort on discussing Vocational Education and Training Centers, political issues, religion, idealism, and human rights in Xinjiang. And then, under the presuppositions of Western-Centrism, the Western media accuses China of violating human rights. However, the Chinese government emphasizes that what happened in Xinjiang is the unrest that has been happening because of the group that wants to separate from China. This paper seeks to explain the real events in Xinjiang, including the problems faced by Xinjiang and the Chinese government, culture, politics, and the psychology behind the western media.

**Keywords: Western-Centralism, Xinjiang, Uyghur, Islam, Politic**

Tulisan ini membahas tentang konflik yang terjadi antara pemerintah pusat dan masyarakat lokal Xinjiang di Tiongkok. Konflik yang terjadi di Xinjiang menjadi perhatian dunia internasional, terutama negara-negara barat. Media-media barat selalu membahas tentang pelanggaran hak asasi manusia, isu agama dan politik maupun Pusat Pendidikan dan Pelatihan yang dibangun oleh pemerintah Tiongkok di Xinjiang. Menurut pengandaian dari konsep Western-Centrism, media Barat menuduh Tiongkok melanggar hak asasi manusia. Namun, pemerintah Tiongkok menekankan bahwa yang terjadi di Xinjiang adalah kerusuhan yang terjadi karena adanya kelompok yang ingin memisahkan diri dari Tiongkok atau gerakan separatisme. Melalui Tulisan ini, peneliti berusaha menjelaskan konflik yang terjadi Xinjiang, termasuk masalah yang dihadapi Xinjiang dan pemerintah Tiongkok, baik dari sisi budaya, politik, dan psikologi yang selalu ditekankan media barat.

**Kata Kunci: Western-Centralism, Xinjiang, Uighur, Islam, Politik**

**Introduction**

Xinjiang Uygur Autonomous Region (XUAR) is located in northwestern China, and It borders 8 countries, including Mongolia, Russia, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Afghanistan, Pakistan, and India. China is a multi-ethnic country, and all ethnic groups in Xinjiang the Chinese nation. In the long process of historical development, Xinjiang's destiny has been closely connected with the destiny of the Chinese nation. However, in Chinese nationalist’s view, for a period of time, hostile forces at home and abroad, especially ethnic separatist forces, religious extremist forces, and violent terrorist forces, deliberately and deny that Xinjiang is an inherent territory of China, deny the fact that Xinjiang has been multi-ethnic settlements, multi-cultural exchanges, and multi-religious coexistence since ancient times. They recognized Xinjiang as the "East Turkestan" and advocated Xinjiang's "independence." (Ma, 2016)

In Chinese history, the dynasty of Xia, Shang, and Zhou emerged in central China. The ethnic groups that gradually merged with the surrounding clans, tribes, and tribal alliances are collectively called Zhuxia or Huaxia. From the Spring and Autumn to the Warring States Period, the Huaxia ethnic group continued to assimilate and merge with the clans, tribes, and tribal alliances surrounding the Dynasty. It gradually formed 7 regions, including Qi, Chu, Yan, Han, Zhao, Wei, and Qin. In 221 BC, Emperor Qin Shihuang established the first unified feudal dynasty. In 202 BC, the Han Dynasty's ancestor, Liu Bang, established a unified feudal Dynasty. From the Han Dynasty to the late Qing Dynasty, the vast areas, including the north and south of the Tianshan Mountains in Xinjiang, are collectively called the Western Regions. Since the Han Dynasty, the Xinjiang region has officially become a part of China's territory. After the Han Dynasty, the Dynasties of Central China were strong and weak, and the relationship with the Western Regions was sparse and close. The central government's ruler of the Xinjiang region was tight and sometimes loose. However, any Dynasty regarded the Western Regions as the homeland and governed the region.（Zeng, 1936）n the history of establishing the Republic of China, the ethnic groups in Xinjiang and the other ethnic have jointly opened up China's vast territory and jointly created a diverse and unified Chinese nation. China's multi-ethnic unification results from the joint efforts of all Chinese people, including the ethnic groups in Xinjiang. （Xinhua, 2019）

The People's Republic of China was founded in 1949, and the Xinjiang Uygur Autonomous Region was founded in 1955. In the long-term historical process, the Chinese territory has had periods of separatism and periods of unity, alternating cycles of unity and separatism, and national unity has always been the direction of the mainstream. In Chinese history, not only has there been an internal conflict between Xinjiang and the central government, we know clearly a conflict that hasn't ended is a civil war between the Nationalist government based in Taipei and the communist government based in Beijing. Still in internal conflict, throughout 2019, we were surprised by the demonstrations in Hong Kong that supposedly demanded democratic freedom and led in their own areas as promised by the communist leaders before Hong Kong returned to China. Back to the Xinjiang problem, what really happened in Xinjiang? The conflict between different ethnicities? Or oppression of ethnic minorities and religious minorities? In this paper, I will use Chinese nationalism spirit to answer this question. The Chinese nationalism is a concept where ethnic equality, national unity, shared prosperity, and development are within the framework of one Chinese. This paper is structured as Introduction, research core, and conclusion. After the introduction, this paper will begin to explore and discuss the Conflict in Xinjiang, and then continue with analysis and discussion of Islam and Uighurs in Xinjiang, and end with the conclusions of this research.

**Understanding the Conflict in Xinjiang**

Quoting a report in Republika online on January 18, 2019, in understanding the conflict in Xinjiang, the media stated that the Xinjiang problem was complete, and the observer had to be balanced in discussing this issue. All parties must view academic sources with references and scientific evidence, not from tendentious freelance articles or political propaganda. The neutral viewer must read from credible media to understanding the real situation in Xinjiang. Then, we must be fair in seeing the situation. The case in Xinjiang is not a case of religion. But religion is the result of discriminatory policies experienced by the Uyghur ethnic majority who are Muslim. The Hui Muslims do not experience direct repression like the Uyghurs even from culturally, linguistically, and socially they are not identical to Han ethnicity or the majority ethnicity in China. ( Cahyadi, 2019)

However, Xinjiang's issue became a sensitive issue when the western media began to link cases in Xinjiang as cases of human rights violations committed by the Chinese government against the Uyghur ethnic minority and oppressing Muslims. Of course, the western media reports about the problems in Xinjiang are not entirely true. As the conflict between the US and China is rampant, ranging from the trade war, US emphasis on Chinese high-tech company Huawei, to the recently passed 'Hong Kong Human Rights Bill.' The US side is always against China, and the western media always reports news that contradicts China.

Western media is more interested in reporting bad things about China than the good things in China. They do not see and observe the real situation in Xinjiang themselves and carelessly report China's situation, which ignores the reality. There are reports that the Vocational Education Center in Xinjiang is like a prison. Actually, the aim of establishing the education center is to provide education to the poor and underprivileged as well as residents who are considered to have been involved in acts of terrorism but are not yet categorized as heavy, so that they have the ability to work and a new way of life so they can escape radicalism. The actual situation which contradicts the oblique reports of the western media about Xinjiang is proven through several interviews and positive coverage conducted by several media in Indonesia, and several statements made by Indonesian figures who came directly and witnessed what conditions in Xinjiang and the state of the Vocational Training Center in Xinjiang. (Wangxin, 2019)

According to Novi Basuki, a Muslim student from Indonesia who is taking a doctoral degree at Sun Yat-Sen University, China, in his writing he explained that what is happening in China is not a matter of religion or in other words, the Chinese government is not oppressing Islam, and Of course, Uyghur ethnicity is not synonymous with Islam as has been thought so far. This means that the Chinese government, through its constitution, has guaranteed the freedom of all its citizens of any ethnicity to follow or not adhere to any religion. There is also no prohibition for its citizens who wish to leave or enter from their original religion to another religion. What is not allowed is religious infidels who have no religion and then force them to adhere to religion. What is not allowed is that those who are not religious make fun of those who are religious and then force them to leave their faith. In essence, whether you want to be religious or not, the decision is entirely up to each individual. No one is allowed to interfere and enforce his will. In short, what the Chinese government prohibits is not his religion but radical acts in the name of religion committed by adherents of that religion. Novi Basuki quoted a statement from Professor Yang Shengmin's field research, the Dean of the Faculty of Ethnography and Sociology of the Minzu University of China who was born into a devout Muslim family who asked if anyone said that the Chinese government was suppressing Islam in Xinjiang, why the number of mosques in Xinjiang can still increase? In essence, the problem of Muslim Uyghurs in Xinjiang is the problem of separatism which is intertwined with religious radicalism. The Chinese government believes that radical religious ideas will be more easily infiltrated by Uyghur Muslim separatists than Uyghur educated and, therefore, have no income. On this basis, the Chinese government established the Vocational Education and Reeducation Center, which many media and human rights activists call "concentration camps" as a place for those tainted with religious radicalism to return to learn the importance of nationalism and various basic skills needed to enter the world of work. (Basuki, 2018)

**Analysis and Discussion About Islam and Xinjiang**

In fact, when Westerners look at the East, they will inevitably fall into Western-centric thinking unconsciously. Edward Said has a fairly clear criticism in the book "Orientalism". Westerners under the Western-centered theory always like to regard the East and even all non-Western cultures as "others", as backward and barbaric, ignorant of human rights, and need to be reformed by the West. However, such a view is entirely Texas sharpshooter fallacy. They ignore the historical and cultural peculiarities of non-Western societies, and thus cannot be easily judged by Western standards.

For most non-Han-Chinese people, both Xinjiang and Islam are far beyond the horizon, and they sometimes see Xinjiang as a "foreign land" in China with an exotic oriental touch. Compared to the problem of Muslim immigrant clashes in Europe and the Chinese government's multiethnic problems, it is indeed difficult for the outside to understand the complexities faced by China. China faces ethnic problems in Xinjiang and faces problems with the identity of the younger generation in Hong Kong. In Hong Kong, there were clashes with a group calling themselves pro-democracy and always trying to fight against the central government. Then, in Taiwan, the Chinese government continued to struggle to reunify Taiwan within the framework of "One China." (Li Anyou, et.al, 2018)

For example, some non-Han-Chinese have not been able to distinguish between ethnic Uyghurs and Islam. Therefore, when reading news on social media and news whose sources are not yet clear, the anti-China group has convicted that there have been human rights violations against Muslims. Unverified news content about concentration camps in Xinjiang carries news as if the communist party wants to carry out non-Han ethnic cleansing prohibiting Islamic religious activities. It is difficult for non-Chinese people to differentiate between Uyghur and Islam; they imagine Uyghur is Islam. Conversely, they never saw an ethnic "Hui" minority who are Muslim as well, and there are also Uyghurs who are not Muslim. (Li Yanrong, 2014)

Although the central government has currently imposed many restrictions on the Uyghurs rather than the Hui, under the regional autonomy system for ethnic minorities implemented in China, both the Hui and the Uyghurs are equally treated as ethnic minorities. For example, such as legal collateral, school subsidies, and various guarantees for other ethnic minorities, including the warranty of religious freedom in Uyghurs, have received legal protection from the central government. Conversely, Many Han people feel that they have been "discriminated" by the government's preferential policies for ethnic minorities, thus converging into political correctness that is hostile to Muslims. Therefore, Han ethnic groups who disagree with priority policies towards ethnic minorities who call themselves "Muhei" groups always reverberate hatred against ethnic minorities. Meanwhile, other Han ethnic groups who are more pro with government policies towards ethnic minorities always emphasize respecting ethnic minority cultures, including minority religions, upholding existing differences. Apart from some Uyghurs' resistance to the Chinese government, what happened in China was also resistance between the ethnic Han themselves, between those who were pro-Uyghur and anti-Uyghur. (Ma Guibao, 2017)

When China implements the "One-child" policy towards the Chinese people, this policy is excluded from the ethnic minorities.(BBC, 2015) This policy was feared by the majority ethnic group that they would be converted to Islam, considering that even though they can mingle and live in peace in their daily habits, there are still many teachings of Islam that are not compatible with Han's ethnic culture. Besides, the Chinese government's guarantee that seems to favor the Hui and Uyghur ethnicity is that China's halal system is much better than in non-Muslim-majority countries. Given the widespread of the Hui people, apart from having a relatively high proportion of halal restaurants in various cities, in recent years have also appeared "halal faked" such as" vaccines "and" halal milk. "At the same time, the architectural style of mosques in various places is increasing and similar with Arab. All of the above will undoubtedly deepen the Han people's fear of being "swallowed up by Islam." Besides, in real life, if some Han people came into conflict with the Hui and Uyghurs, the local government would occasionally comply with their wishes and suppress the ethnic Han on the grounds of "maintaining stability," "a harmonious society," and "tolerate ethnic minorities. "The result naturally made the Han people even more hostile. The suspicion and hostility caused by problems such as the above cannot be avoided due to the negligence of public power. However, the so-called "Islamic prohibition" is clearly largely imaginary.( Côté, 2015: 136-151)

It is abundantly clear that most people do not understand the complex multi-ethnic in China, especially in Xinjiang. So, in the end, those who don't know the real situation always rely on anti-Chinese news about the bloody tragedy in Xinjiang. They shouted slogans of human rights and the freedom that God has given humanity, and China has deprived the Uyghurs of ethnicity. But actually, they are not concerned about Muslims' problems in Xinjiang; they prefer to attack the Chinese government because China violates human rights. However, there is also the question of "why did the Muslim world, especially the countries in the Middle East, not immediately help ethnic Xinjiang escape from the crime called ethnic cleansing?" If we look at China, Islam, and Xinjiang or Uyghurs from this perspective, it seems that this world is just two ideologies left, namely Islam and non-Islam. Meanwhile, we know that people can have multiple identities; and there is plenty of room for interpretation for each of these identities. (Zhang Junkai and Liao Shifeng, 2019)

As an example again, that the "re-Islamization" of the Uyghur people is a fairly new product because China can be said to have entered the post-communism stage. The phenomenon of identity re-establishment has occurred everywhere. There were conflicts between the Hui and Uyghur Muslims in which they both claimed that they were "genuine" Muslims. The dispute between the two ethnic minorities is no less than the dispute between the Han and Uyghur ethnicities. The large number of Muslim fighters who have exiled themselves to the Middle East also, on average, do not sympathize with the struggle of the Palestinian people. Instead, they are oriented towards Israel and want to learn from Israel about building an ideal country. The implementation of the CCP's education and training system in Xinjiang so-called "re-education camps" in the West is actually supported by political leaders in many Arab countries because these politicized Islamic countries have widespread sectarian conflicts, struggles, and oppression of their own Muslims. Then, actually, human rights in Arab countries are lower in China. We can compare it to Saudi Arabia's treatment of the Shiites and Egypt's oppression of the *Ikhwanul Muslimin.* Therefore the re-education camps in China, in their opinion, can be considered a moderate measure.

Also, the netizen's comments revealed that most netizens imagined that Xinjiang lived in only a large number of Uyghurs, and a small number of Han, while the Uyghurs wanted to establish East Turkestan but were the central government massacre that symbolizes Han chauvinism. The above picture is truly magical. First of all, the current distribution of ethnic groups in Xinjiang, whether Uyghurs or Hans, has not exceeded half of the population. Uyghurs are approximately less than 10% more than Hans. Besides, according to the Yining Incident of 1944-49 (the Central government called the Three-Region Revolution) as an example, the unrest has brought Xinjiang close to independence, but "East Turkistan" is just an ideology supported by the Soviet Union and supported by the Uyghurs of the Republic of China. At that time, Mongolians, naturalized Russians, Kyrgyz, and there is constant discord among Kazakhs, Huis, and Uyghurs. Uyghur elites ultimately failed to shape the unified identity among all ethnic groups through the "plea for nation-building." This inter-ethnic friction persists. For example, after the Cultural Revolution in China, the Central government promoted large-scale Uyghur language education in Xinjiang out of political reassurance. As a result, Kazakhs and Tajiks were dissatisfied with them and believed that they were oppressed by Uyghur cultural hegemony. If Westerners look carefully enough, they will be able to break out of the dualistic framework of "Han oppression of Uyghurs" and discover the complexity of history, geography, culture, and politics that this framework conceals.

Honestly, the topic of re-education camps is not something new in Xinjiang but has always been an excuse to attack the Chinese government. Defending Muslims and ethnic minorities is one reason anti-Chinese is actually the main goal of echoing human rights in Xinjiang. In fact, acts of resistance tinted with violence in Xinjiang cannot weaken the Chinese government, even more legitimacy for China to maintain domestic stability. Like when the United States of America gave the Uyghurs support to establish an East Turkestan state, this action actually created a split between the ethnic groups in Uyghur between the secular and radical groups. The result of the Westerners’ intervention is to weaken the ethnic unity of the Uyghurs and further exacerbate conditions such as the civil war in Xinjiang and the resulting terrorist force in the East Turkestan movement, which has resulted in the Chinese government being used the term "counter-terrorism" to maintain stability.

Xinjiang has always been the focus of Western media attention, although the Chinese Communist Party has also responded, the two sides have never overlapped. In addition to the fictional reality of the "re-education camps," what lies behind it include competition between China and the West over ideology and discourse power, the relationship between religion and politics, and ethnic Chinese policy dilemmas. The following writing will quote the interview of the Taiwan government television which has been deleted, but the author managed to get it again from the author's friend who is at National Taiwan University, along with the complete link of the article. The interview with Wu Qi Na, an associate researcher at the Institute of Modern History of the Academia Sinica, on Xinjiang issues and professional perspectives on Chinese modern political history. The interview that was broadcast to the public became a controversy, as pro-independence Taiwan netizens felt that Professor Wu had become China's agent or spokesman for the Xinjiang issue. However, because this paper is an academic journal that researches and explores the Xinjiang case from a non-western and non-Chinese perspective, therefore the author continues Professor Wu's exploration by writing Xinjiang from a neutral point.

The reality behind the demolition of Xinjiang mosques and build the re-education camps, according to Professor Wu, during the Cultural Revolution in China, the Chinese Communist Party (CCP) shared revolutionary discourse to suppress all religions. Xinjiang did demolish many mosques. However, after the Cultural Revolution, the CCP vigorously subsidized local mosque projects for its rule and political reassurance. The current number of mosques in Xinjiang is already over and surpassing Iran and only lower than Indonesia. Although the government occasionally demolishes mosques, most of them are aimed at illegal structures, and the number of local mosques is still considerable.

Professor Wu's added to stop the infiltration of terrorists and stem the exposure of terrorist teachings that have infiltrated Uighur society. The CCP has begun to reinstate the old ways they used in Yan'an, often known as re-education. This education system is that everyone is gathered in one room or class, learn to know yourself, criticize yourself, or check your way of thinking. Is it in line with the CCP or not? This method was useful in the Yan'an and Mao eras when the central government was able to control political discourse and mobilize the masses. However, in the current generation of globalization, this method is challenging to implement. Given the rapid disclosure of information and the fast global exchange of information, this method is ineffective, but these educational camps are different from those of the NAZI concentration camps. (Liu Yanting, 2020)

In fact, Western media always like to compare Xinjiang re-education camps with Nazi concentration camps, but this is actually wrong. In Chinese historical tradition, "race" has never been the main basis for the government to implement policies. On the contrary, in the Western historical tradition, there have been countless persecutions and massacres done by anti-Semites. Therefore, when Westerners look at other cultural traditions in the world, they also tend to use their own experience to look at others. They don't know that there is more than one way of looking at things in the world. When they criticized China with their own human rights standards, they were actually already Western-centrism.

**Conclusion**

Research on Xinjiang is complex and challenging. Western academics represented by America and academies from China faced each other to present the realities in Xinjiang, including in Indonesia's Muslim-majority country. Various factors are suspected of causing the emergence of the conflict between the Uyghurs and the government in Xinjiang, which is economic disparity. Some academics even say that there is persecution in Xinjiang because of ethnic differences with Han ethnic rulers. But suppose we study Xinjiang's history and not only look at documentaries that are deliberately set because of political interests. In that case, we will find it accurate that there are historical relationships between Uyghurs, Mongols, and other ethnicities in China before China became a republic.

The history of cooperation between Xinjiang and other ethnic groups in China goes back thousands of years. Xinjiang also took part in the revolution to turn the empire in China into a republic; of course, as part of history and role of China's unity, Xinjiang is an inviolable area of ​​China. The difficulty faced by the Chinese Communist Party or the Chinese central government today is facing various targets that lead to separatism. In addition to the Xinjiang issue, the target from within is the case of rejection of the extradition law to China is also in the spotlight, and the old case of unification with Taiwan continues to fluctuate. Of course, there are many interests behind this; the United States, as a superpower today, is worried about the rapid economic growth in China and makes the issues that occur in China's territory with human rights violations. America forgets that America's human rights context is a western concept of human rights that cannot be directly applied in a country with Confucian culture. If the Western media can only judge Xinjiang with their own feelings and historical experience, they will never be able to unearth the truth. After all, the Chinese government has been presumed guilty as a genocide within the framework of "justice vs. evil" that has been set up by Western centrism.

On the one hand, China should also be aware that re-education camps are very unsuitable for this era. Globalization has made humans have the right to live more peacefully according to their life beliefs. The state can regulate not everything about life. On the other hand, demonstrators in general, especially in Xinjiang, need to realize that individual problems or individual conflicts between different ethnicities are often manipulated and turned into a movement to disrupt the lives of Xinjiang people and destroy the order of state life in general. The Chinese government needs to correct itself, recognizing that re-education camps are no longer suitable for all regions of China as in the era of the revolution. Xinjiang people also need to realize that the government's efforts to improve the standard and quality of life of ethnic minorities continue to be a significant concern and will not quit because Xinjiang and the minorities that live in it are part of China.

In the end, as overseas democrats who care about China's future, they should think about whether there is a third way between Western centralism and Chinese nationalism. Between the actual "governance" thesis and the abstract "human rights" issue, is there a possibility of moving forward together instead of rudely sacrificing either side? I believe that this issue is something that all people who care about Uyghurs, Xinjiang, and China should work hard to think about.

**Reference**

Basuki, Novi. 2018. “Menjernihkan Permasalahan Muslim Uighur di China.” In <https://kumparan.com/novi-basuki/menjernihkan-permasalahan-muslim-uighur-di-china-1qBQrzJLMw9/full>. Latest update 1 March 2021.

BBCNews. 2015. 《分析：中國新版計劃生育終結一胎化政策》，資料來源：<https://www.bbc.com/zhongwen/trad/china/2015/10/151029_ana_china_birth_rule，2021/03/10>. (BBCNews, 2015, Analysis: China's new family planning policy to end one-child policy. In <https://www.bbc.com/zhongwen/trad/china/2015/10/151029_ana_china_birth_rule>, Latest update 10 March 2021.

Cahyadi, Herri. 2019.”Memahami Konflik Uighur di Xinjiang.” In <https://www.republika.co.id/berita/pliyh6440/memahami-konflik-uighur-di-xinjiang>. Latest update 1 March 2021.

Côté, Isabelle. 2015. “The enemies within: targeting Han Chinese and Hui minorities in Xinjiang.” Asian Ethnicity, Vol. 16, No. 2, 136–151.

马小丽，2016。《新时期对加强新疆民族团结工作的思考》，資料來源：<https://www.cnki.com.cn/Article/CJFDTotal-SHNG201625074.htm，2021/03/01>. (Ma Xiaoli, 2016. "Thoughts on Strengthening Xinjiang National Unity Work in the New Era") in <https://www.cnki.com.cn/Article/CJFDTotal-SHNG201625074.htm，2021/03/01>, Latest update 1 March 2021.

马贵宝，2017。《马贵宝：停下来吧，穆黑们！| 我们 · 随笔 》，資料來源：<https://www.sohu.com/a/159032302_336921，2021/03/10>. （Ma Guibao, “Ma Guibao: Stop it, Muhei! | Us · Essays”）in <https://www.sohu.com/a/159032302_336921>, Latest update 10 March 2021.

黎安友、施道安、何大明，2018.《書摘：國家認同的難題——新疆、香港和台灣》，<https://theinitium.com/article/20181217-bookdigest-andrew-nathanchina-diplomacy-security/，2021/03/09>. (Li Anyou, Shi Daoan, He Daming, 2018. "Book Digest: The Dilemma of National Identity-Xinjiang, Hong Kong and Taiwan.”) <https://theinitium.com/article/20181217-bookdigest-andrew-nathanchina-diplomacy-security/，2021/03/09>.

李艳荣，2014，《新时期加强民族团结、建设美好新疆问题的思考》，人資社科 2014（19）：350-351。（Li Yanrong, 2014 "Reflections on Strengthening National Unity and Building a Beautiful Xinjiang in the New Era", Human Resources and Social Sciences 2014 (19): 350-351）.

劉燕婷，2020，《劉燕婷觀點：被反中消費的新疆，被外行出征的學者》，資料來源：<https://www.storm.mg/article/2234333?page=6，2021/03/10.（Liu> Yanting, 2020, “Liu Yanting's point of view: anti-China, scholars expelled by outsiders consumed Xinjiang.”in <https://www.storm.mg/article/2234333?page=6>, Latest update 10 March 2021.

新华网，2019。《新疆的若干历史问题》，資料來源：<http://www.xinhuanet.com/politics/2019-07/21/c_1124779069.htm，2021/03/01>. (Xinhuanet, 2019. "Several Historical Issues in Xinjiang") in <http://www.xinhuanet.com/politics/2019-07/21/c_1124779069.htm>, Latest update 1 March 2021.

曾問吾，《中國經營西域史》（商務印書館，上海，1936）。見<https://www.cnki.com.cn/Article/CJFDTotal-YJSF201104011.htm>. (Zeng Wenwu, "Sejarah Bisnis Cina di Wilayah Barat" (The Commercial Press, Shanghai, 1936). In https://www.cnki.com.cn/Article/CJFDTotal-YJSF201104011.htm

張鈞凱、廖士鋒，2019，《摘下有色眼鏡 理性看待「再教育營」的虛與實》，資料來源：<https://duoweicn.dwnews.com/TW-2019%E5%B9%B4041%E6%9C%9F/10007767.html，2021/03/10>. （Zhang Junkai, Liao Shifeng. 2019. “Take off the colored glasses and rationally view the reality and reality of the "re-education camp.”in <https://duoweicn.dwnews.com/TW-2019%E5%B9%B4041%E6%9C%9F/10007767.html>, Latest update 10 March 2021）.

Wangxin, 2019. “Menyibak Kebenaran tentang Xinjiang dari Laporan Miring Media Barat.” In <https://news.detik.com/kolom/d-4817805/menyibak-kebenaran-tentang-xinjiang-dari-laporan-miring-media-barat>. Latest update 1 March 2021.