

ENHANCING COUNTRY IMAGE: A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF TOURISM STRATEGY BETWEEN INDONESIA AND MALAYSIA 2010-2015

Devina Anggiany Putri *President University*

Riski Mohamad Baskoro *President University*¹

Abstrak

Persaingan global telah menjadi fenomena yang lazim dihadapi saat ini. Negara berkembang dan negara maju pun bersaing satu sama lain untuk menghasilkan sesuatu yang berbeda dengan memaksimalkan potensi dan kinerja untuk mendapatkan keuntungan yang akan berdampak pada aspek politik dan ekonomi. Sektor pariwisata merupakan salah satu potensi negara yang memiliki peran besar untuk mendukung kepentingan nasional dengan memberikan hasil yang menguntungkan. Pariwisata adalah industri yang efisien untuk mendapatkan keuntungan secara finansial dan meningkatkan reputasi negara terutama untuk negara-negara yang memiliki banyak sumber daya alam. Sebagai negara tropis, pemerintah Indonesia dan Malaysia telah membuat kebijakan pariwisata yang digariskan dalam beberapa strategi. Strategi meliputi pemasaran dan kegiatan promosi yang bertujuan untuk membangun kepercayaan publik terhadap negara-negara terkait dengan mengundang lebih banyak pengunjung asing dan investor. Dalam menanggapi hal ini, Indonesia dan Malaysia melakukan diplomasi publik di dalam dan luar negeri melalui kegiatan pariwisata untuk menciptakan reputasi negara yang baik. Tulisan ini akan membahas strategi pariwisata Indonesia dan Malaysia dalam upaya untuk meningkatkan citra negara di masyarakat internasional dengan menekankan pelaksanaan diplomasi publik melalui industri pariwisata selama kurun waktu 2010-2015. Dengan demikian, kami akan menerapkan metode perbandingan dalam meneliti kelebihan dan kelemahan strategi pariwisata di Indonesia dan Malaysia.

Kata Kunci: *Pariwisata, Strategi, Citra Bangsa, Promosi dan Pemasaran, Potensi dan Kinerja*

Abstract

The global competition has become a mandatory phenomenon faced nowadays. Both the emerging economic country and the advanced economic country are competing each other to create and produce something different by maximizing their potentials and performances to obtain more profit that will be impacted to the politic and the economic aspects. Tourism sector is one of the country's potentials which has a big role to support the national interests by attaining benefit immensely. Tourism is an efficient industry to earn financial profit and enhance country reputation especially for nations who have abundant of natural resources. As tropical countries, Indonesia and Malaysia government has set up tourism policy which has been outlined into several strategies. The strategies include marketing and promotion activity which purpose to establish public trust towards related

¹ Corresponding authors: anggianynd@yahoo.com , riskibaskoro@president.ac.id . Riski M Baskoro is a permanent lecturer of International Relations Study Program at President University. Devita Anggiany completed her bachelor degree in International Relations at President University.

countries by inviting more foreign visitors and investors. In responding to this, both countries are branding their nations by doing a public diplomacy in domestic and overseas through tourism activity. This paper will examine the tourism strategy of Indonesia and Malaysia in attempt to increase country image in international community by emphasizing the implementation of public diplomacy in branding the nation through tourism industry during 2010-2015 time frameworks. Thus, we will apply a comparison method in exploring the strengths and weaknesses of tourism strategy in Indonesia and Malaysia.

Keyword: Tourism, Strategy, Country Image, Marketing and Promotion, Potentials and Performances

I. INTRODUCTION

Tourism has become one of the main forces of change in the world today for throughout the decades.² Tourism has encountered to wind up the quickest and the biggest growing service industries in the global economy.³ According to the United Nations World Tourism Organization (UNWTO) long-term forecast *Tourism Towards 2030*, international tourist arrivals are estimated to continue increase and remain steady by 2030.⁴ International tourist arrivals in developing country destinations like Asia, Latin America, Central and Eastern Europe, Eastern Mediterranean Europe, the Middle East and Africa will increase the developed country destinations at twice. As a result, arrivals in developing countries are expected to surpass those in developed country by 2015.⁵ Then in 2030, more than a half of universal landings will be conducted in developing country destinations while the rest will be visited developed country destinations.⁶ Indonesia and Malaysia are two neighboring countries in ASEAN that going to become one of the most international tourism destinations. The massive marketing and promotion in tourism is very essential to establish a strong country image in order to create a public trust towards tourism businesses. In attracting more visitors from the worldwide, both countries also conducted tourism promotion program since the early 19th century which has successfully gained profit and exploited their tourism industry through intensive promotions.

Therefore, this paper will be focused on a comprehensive plan made by Indonesia and Malaysia government that purposed to boost the tourism industry during 2010-2015 time

² UNWTO. (2015). *Why Tourism?* Retrieved from <http://www2.unwto.org/content/why-tourism>

³ UNWTO. 2015. *Why Tourism?* Retrieved from <http://www2.unwto.org/content/why-tourism>

⁴ UNWTO. (2011). *Tourism towards 2030*. Retrieved from <http://dtxqtq4w60xqpw.cloudfront.net/sites/all/files/docpdf/atconf6-wp065en.pdf>

⁵ UNWTO. (2014). *UNWTO Tourism Highlight: 2014 edition*. Retrieved from <http://www.e-unwto.org/doi/pdf/10.18111/9789284416226>

⁶UNWTO. (2011). *Tourism towards 2030*. Retrieved from <http://dtxqtq4w60xqpw.cloudfront.net/sites/all/files/docpdf/atconf6-wp065en.pdf>

framework. Due to the methodology is using comparative study, so we will go directly compare each of strategies released by Indonesia and Malaysia. We have found several tourism program from each official government during this last five years. There are five-year planning program, transformation program, National Tourism Master Plan, and domestic and international promotion board. Each program has different content yet still has an equal focus and objective one to another. The strategies do not merely stand by itself, but it comes from a primary base that become a reference to develop the tourism industry in Indonesia and Malaysia called as policy. In this regards, we will only discuss about the elaboration of the tourism strategy in Indonesia and Malaysia during 2010-2015.

II. RPJMN 2010-2014 vs 10th Malaysia Plan

Considering the topic of this paper is concerning on tourism planning issue, thus, we only emphasize on the strategies and its implementations as an effort to increase country image and public trust which led to the welfare of local society. First, it comes up with a planning program that cover for the next five year. Both Indonesia and Malaysia have a five year planning program that can be compared each other. Indonesia with RPJMN (*Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Menengah*) has covered five year planning program since 2005. Due to the time scope of this paper is during 2010-2015, so we only discuss about the second phase which occurred in 2010-2014. Tourism sector has already mentioned and included in RPJMN in the fields of public welfare. It was estimated to grow the number of domestic and foreign tourists by 20% within 5 years.⁷ There were several efforts to conduct the planning such as promote the tourism destination through marketing channels and apply a creative and effective advertisement, improve the quality of tourism infrastructure and tourism facilities, increase the capacity of government and local tourism stakeholders to achieve the level of quality of service and competitive hospitality management in the region.⁸

Meanwhile, Malaysia also has a five-year plan since 1966, but tourism was given its importance starting from the 6th Malaysia Plan in 1991 until the 11th Malaysia Plan nowadays. Because of the scope and limitation of this paper is in between 2010-2015, we only focuses on the 10th Malaysia Plan which occurred in 2011-2015. To achieve Malaysia

⁷ Ibid

⁸ Ibid

Vision 2020, transforming a nation needs a holistic and focused approach. The holistic and comprehensive tourism strategies are includes the environmental issues to help valuing the environmental endowments and improve the quality of live.⁹ These key strategic of Tenth Malaysia Plan are put tourism into their concern because the government is really focus on improving the quality of the environment which then it will help to support the tourism activity in Malaysia.¹⁰ During the tenth Malaysia Plan, Malaysia tourism activity concentrated on improving the maintenance of the existing tourism destinations and enhancing the intensive promotion.¹¹ The target is to advance Malaysia's position to become the top 10 of global tourism receipts by increasing the sector's contribution approximately RM 115 billion and providing 2 million employments in tourism sector in 2015.¹²

Other than that, 10th Malaysia Plan also elaborate tourism industry in specific to ecotourism sector. Malaysia has concerned their five years planning by paying attention on how they manage the environmental situation to gain benefit for their economic.¹³ They allowing industries to take this opportunity and use the incentives provided by the Government through the Green Technology Financing Scheme to enhance the application of green technology in the production of goods and provision of services.¹⁴ Green technology has been described as one of the emerging drivers of economic growth not only to ensure sustainable energy growth for the future through energy interdependent and promote efficient utilization, but also the sustainability of the country economically, socially and environmentally.¹⁵

It can be seen that Malaysia has already planned their future through the development and maintenance of tourism industry that covered in the 10th Malaysia Plan widely and in detail while Indonesia is less steeped to put tourism as their main strategy in the five year development plan because the RPJMN still consists of general aspects. Yet, Indonesia will not stop there, the strategy of RPJMN will be continued by each Ministries and institutions

⁹ Government of Malaysia. (2011). Tenth Malaysia Plan. Retrieved from https://www.pmo.gov.my/dokumenattached/RMK/RMK10_Eds.pdf

¹⁰ Ibid

¹¹ Ibid

¹² Government of Malaysia. (2013). *Tourism & Travel Related Services*. Retrieved from <http://myservices.miti.gov.my/web/guest/tourism-travel-related>

¹³ Government of Malaysia. (2010). *10th Malaysia Plan*. Retrieved from https://www.pmo.gov.my/dokumenattached/RMK/RMK10_Eds.pdf

¹⁴ Malaysian Green Technology Corporation. 2012. *Green Technology Financing Scheme (GTFS)*. Retrieved from <https://www.gtfs.my/news/green-technology-financing-scheme-gtfs>

¹⁵ Ibid

related. From our perspective, Indonesia and Malaysia have the same goals which will be achieved from tourism industry in their five-years planning. The economic benefit which support the welfare of the society is will become their main target from tourism development. But the way they deliver the strategy in their five year development plan are totally different. It is proven that Malaysia is implement a holistic and focused approach in their strategy rather than Indonesia. Indonesia still needs other support from the Ministries and institutions related to pursue the strategy towards tourism development because their five-year development planning only provide a brief and basic strategy of tourism sector. Even though Ministry of Tourism Malaysia also has their own strategy, but their five-year development planning has encompassed several specified tourism strategies.

III. MP3EI vs Malaysia Transformation Program

The second government strategy on tourism would be poured in an acceleration or transformation program in both Indonesia and Malaysia. In 2011, President Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono has formed a Masterplan for Acceleration and Expansion of Indonesia Economic Development (*Masterplan Percepatan dan Perluasan Pembangunan Ekonomi Indonesia – MP3EI*) which hoped to support and accelerate the existing development plans in order to place Indonesia at the top ten advanced economies in the world by 2025 and world's top six by the year 2050.¹⁶ To support the acceleration and expansion of economic development in Indonesia, the Government has set a number of major programs in collaboration with key stakeholders including government ministries and the private sector in the development of MP3EI program. Based on stakeholders' agreement the focus of development was categorized into 8 main programs, i.e.: agriculture, mining, energy, industrial, marine, tourism, telecommunication, and the development of strategic areas.¹⁷ As a country consisting of thousands islands and located between two continents and two oceans, the

¹⁶ Government of Indonesia. (2011). *Indonesia Master Plan Acceleration and Expansion of Indonesia Economic Development 2011-2025*. Retrieved from https://www.google.com/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=5&cad=rja&uact=8&ved=0ahUKEwiLw726n8fLAhWKvRQKHdFICqwQFggzMAQ&url=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.aseanbriefing.com%2Fuserfiles%2Fresources-pdfs%2FIndonesia%2FFDI%2FASEAN_Indonesia_Master%2520Plan%2520Acceleration%2520and%2520Expansion%2520of%2520Indonesia%2520Economic%2520Development%25202011-2025.pdf&usg=AFQjCNFmr1nF-PUUdEd8_i6nR2UaGvC1fg&bvm=bv.117218890,d.d24

¹⁷ Ibid

government has classified six economic corridors as the main strategy of MP3EI.¹⁸ Bali and Nusa Tenggara Economic Corridor was considered as one of a “Gateway for Tourism and National Food Support.”

Tourism became one of the main economic activity in Bali and Nusa Tenggara after fisher and animal husbandry. The increasing number of foreign tourists visit in 2010 has consequently increased the value of tourism’s contribution in foreign exchange revenues and poverty alleviation with the amount of USD 7.6 billion compared to the USD 7.3 billion in 2008.¹⁹ Tourism and creative economy contributes significantly to the economy of Indonesia. The direct contribution of tourism to national GDP in 2011 amounted to Rp. 222.27 billion.²⁰ Bali and Nusa Tenggara has abundant natural beautifulness. Bali with its plentiful of beaches and cultural heritage and Nusa Tenggara which possesses an endangered species tourism (Komodo Island) are create special icon for these two province. Bali and Nusa Tenggara was labelled as the gateway for tourism therefore, they will get priority in terms of infrastructure building and accessibility to support the community’s welfare and ensure sustainable development.

Thus, tourism industry was intended to play an active role to improve local people’s prosperity especially in the east part of Indonesia. Other than that, to support the enhancement of foreign visitors and its length of stay in Bali and Nusa Tenggara, marketing and promotion are focused as their main strategy. The marketing strategy should be adjusted on the certain foreign tourists targeted and was intended to expose Bali as the center of tourism in Indonesia and to improve the image of Bali as the top world-class tourism destination by applying the following theme ”Wonderful Indonesia”, “Wonderful Nature”, ”Wonderful Culture”, ”Wonderful People”, ”Wonderful Culinary”, and ”Wonderful Price“. Mr. Jero Wacik stated that Wonderful Indonesia should be effectively promoted in the early 2011.²¹ The word “Wonderful” reflects the natural beauty and culture especially in the east part of Indonesia.

¹⁸ Ibid

¹⁹ Ibid

²⁰ World Travel and Tourism Council. (2015). *Travel & Tourism Economic Impact 2015 Indonesia*. Retrieved from <https://www.wttc.org/-/media/files/reports/economic%20impact%20research/countries%202015/indonesia2015.pdf>

²¹ Asdhiana, I Made. (2011). “*Wonderful Indonesia*” *Mulai Dipromosikan*. Retrieved from <http://travel.kompas.com/read/2011/01/06/15410311/Wonderful.Indonesia.Mulai.Dipromosikan>

The second important strategy was allowing foreign visitors to experience enormous tourism in Bali and Nusa Tenggara. Accessibility and adequate flight routes to tourism destinations in Nusa Tenggara is the key success to attract more visitors.²² In order to facilitate foreign visitors, this master plan is forming rules and regulation towards foreign arrivals who travel through water transportation. But unfortunately, the program implementation has not realized by the government until now. The current Minister of Transportation, Mr. Ignasius Jonan has just declared that they are ready to open the port as facility for domestic and foreign ships or yacht tourism especially in Labuan Bajo, East Nusa Tenggara.²³

However, to support the development of tourism industry, Malaysia has reached a defining moment in its development path. The Government has created a blueprint to transform the country towards its following stage of development. Government has initiated to form a national transformation program which divided into four Main Pillars; 1Malaysia concept, The Government Transformation Program (GTP), The Economic Transformation Program (ETP) and 10th Malaysia Plan. The first pillar, 1Malaysia, People First, Performance Now, is meant to unite all Malaysians who together represent the key stakeholder of the Government.²⁴ The second pillar is the Government Transformation Program (GTP) which will carry out under the National Key Result Areas (NKRAs).²⁵ The third pillar will be the New Economic Model (NEM) resulting from an ambitious Economic Transformation Program (ETP) through and implementation of 12 Entry Point Projects (EPP).²⁶ The fourth pillar is the 10th Malaysia Plan 2011-2015 which will represent the five-year development planning.²⁷

“1Malaysia: People First, Performance Now” concept was established by PM Tun Abdul Razak in April 2010 to encourage government leaders perform their tasks efficiently, reliably and responsibly for the sake of the society. 1Malaysia concept has not touched on tourism development explicitly. But it has more complex and structured strategies under 1Malaysia concept which aim to create a New Economic Model (NEM). Prime Minister Tun

²² Ibid

²³ Galih Gumelar. (2015). *Menhub Akui Banyak Habiskan Anggaran untuk Bandara-Pelabuhan*. Retrieved from <http://www.cnnindonesia.com/ekonomi/20151020202437-78-86196/menhub-akui-banyak-habiskan-anggaran-untuk-bandara-pelabuhan/>

²⁴ Government of Malaysia. (2010). *New Economic Model: Part I: Strategic Policy Directions*. Retrieved from <http://www.epu.gov.my/epu-theme/pdf/nem.pdf>

²⁵ Ibid

²⁶ Ibid

²⁷ Ibid

Abdul Razak has emphasized high-skilled human capital, efficient public services, a strengthened private sector and equal opportunity for all Malaysians as themes to be embraced in the NEM.²⁸ The New Economic Model (NEM) has been achieved through Government Transformation Program (GTP) and Economic Transformation Program (ETP) which intended to realize Malaysia being an advanced nation with inclusiveness and sustainability in line with the goals set forth in Vision 2020. One of the key messages of the New Economic Model (NEM) framework is to utilize on natural resources as their primary asset. The sixth largest contribution to Malaysia's GDP is the services sector coming from tourism industry.²⁹ The tourism sector depend heavily on natural resources such as tropical rainforests and marine life as key attractions.³⁰

Unfortunately, Malaysia does not publish any strategic planning in detail because it is only available for internal and very confidential. We tried to obtain the data but we only can provide tourism policies by the Prime Minister directly. Several strategic planning towards tourism development already comprised in the government planning project, Government Transformation Program (GTP) and Economic Transformation Program (ETP) under the concept of 1Malaysia by Prime Minister Tun Abdul Razak. Government Transformation Program (GTP) was first introduced in April 2009 which comprise of several target called as National Key Results Areas (NKRAs).³¹ During the first and second phase of GTP, tourism became the main focus of Malaysia transformation program in the GTP 2 (2013-2015). It is included in the NKRAs number five out of seven NKRAs. The number five NKRAs is about improving rural development in attempt to provide incomes and facilities for local people.³² The program is called Enhancing Rural Areas via the 21st Century Village (CV).³³

There main focus for the Rural Development NKRA in the GTP 2.0 is to encourage young people to stay living and develop their own village.³⁴ Tourism industry is included as the main economic activity in the village along with agriculture and cottage industry. The government targets to expand the operations of industries and factories that currently exist in

²⁸ Government of Malaysia. (2010). *New Economic Model: Part I: Strategic Policy Directions*. Retrieved from <http://www.epu.gov.my/epu-theme/pdf/nem.pdf>

²⁹ Mohsen, Ahmar Shah. (2015). *Tourism industry now 6th largest GDP contributor, says Najib*. Retrieved from <http://www.thesundaily.my/news/1586311>

³⁰ Government of Malaysia. (2010). *New Economic Model: Part I: Strategic Policy Directions*. Pg 94. Retrieved from <http://www.epu.gov.my/epu-theme/pdf/nem.pdf>

³¹ Government of Malaysia. (2013). *What Is The Government Transformation Programme (GTP)?* Retrieved from <http://www.epu.gov.my/en/goverment-transformation-programme>

³² Ibid

³³ Ibid

³⁴ Ibid

rural areas due to a tight competitions between industries in the village. Ecotourism is considered as a great business opportunity in the village which having potential to grow and expand. It is expected 37,800 households or 189,000 persons are gain profit from this program.³⁵

The government formed Economic Transformation Program (ETP) in September 2010 as a part of a comprehensive government agenda to help achieving the target in 2015 particularly in tourism sector.³⁶ The ETP was formed upon the policy directions, strategies and programs of the 10th Malaysia Plan.³⁷ The ETP will be determined by eight Strategic Reform Initiatives (SRIs) which will form the foundation of the relevant policy measures.³⁸ According to the Strategic Reform Initiatives (SRIs) number seven about enhancing the sources of growth, Malaysia must build its strategic location considered with the qualified benefits that come from its natural resource to generate production platforms which drive high value added growth continuously.³⁹ There must be a focus on economies of scale through growth corridors to motivate promising growths into new markets and ecotourism is included as one of their main focus in developing tourism sector in Malaysia.⁴⁰ There are several efforts in developing tourism industry especially for ecotourism activity such as expanding ecotourism markets through domestic and regional partnerships, improve tourism services by ensuring quality services in order to make sure personal safety and convenience for travelers, and also through an active partnership between the government and the private sector domestically with multi-national companies internationally in order to spreading the ‘Malaysia, Truly Asia’ brand far beyond the tourism sector.

The ETP consisted of 12 National Keys Economic Areas (NKEAs) which was announced in the Tenth Malaysia Plan as a goal to achieve significant contributions to Malaysia’s economic performance.⁴¹ In order to support the strategies listed in the 10th Malaysia Plan, the tourism NKEAs would concentrate on increasing foreign visitors through implementation of 12 Entry Point Projects (EPPs) as follows: Affordable Luxury (EPP 1:

³⁵ Ibid

³⁶ Government of Malaysia. (2013). *Overview of ETP*. Retrieved from http://etp.pemandu.gov.my/About_ETP-@-Overview_of_ETP.aspx

³⁷ Ibid

³⁸ Ibid

³⁹ Ibid

⁴⁰ Government of Malaysia. (2011). *National Economic Model*. Retrieved from <http://www.epu.gov.my/epu-theme/pdf/nem.pdf>

⁴¹ Government of Malaysia. (2010). *Overview of ETP*. Retrieved from http://etp.pemandu.gov.my/About_ETP-@-Overview_of_ETP.aspx

Positioning Malaysia as a duty-free shopping destination for tourist goods; EPP 2: Labelling Kuala Lumpur City Centre-Bukit Bintang area as an exciting shopping zone; and EPP 3: Establishing three new finest outlets in Malaysia), Nature Adventure (EPP 4: Establishing Malaysia as a global biodiversity sites), Family Fun (EPP 5: Developing an eco-nature integrated resort in Sabah; and EPP 6: Creating a Straits Riviera), Events, Entertainment, Spa and Sports (EPP 7: Targetting more international events; EPP 8: Establishing dedicated entertainment zones; EPP 9a: Developing local expertise of the spa industry; and EPP 9b: Expanding sports tourism offerings in Malaysia beyond hosting events), and Business Tourism (EPP 10: Establishing Malaysia as a leading business tourism destinations; EPP 11: Enhancing connectivity to priority medium markets; and EPP 12: Improving rates, mix and quality of hotels).

Basically, the second comparison will explain about the acceleration concept of Indonesia and Malaysia. Basically, between Indonesia and Malaysia transformation program are put tourism industry into their priority. But what make them different is the way they deliver the strategy towards tourism industry. Indonesia along with Mr. Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono has directly emphasized tourism sector in Bali and Nusa Tenggara into one of the economic corridors in *MP3EI*. It includes the exposure of infrastructure issues, promotion and marketing strategy until the attempt to raise a prosperity of the local people. While, 1Malaysia concept is more compound rather than *MP3EI* because they have two supporting passages which are GTP and ETP. Even though in 1Malaysia concept has not explicitly mentioned about tourism sector, but then it explained deeper in both GTP and ETP. 1Malaysia concept seeks to increase race relations to ensure that Malaysia people can bind close unity. While Indonesia already focused on their local people welfare by empowering tourism sector particularly in Bali and Nusa Tenggara. In this part, the focus is about whether tourism industry has already become the main concern in their transformation planning or not. Evidently, Indonesia is straighter to the point in examining tourism industry rather than Malaysia.

IV. RIPPARNAS 2010-2025 vs MTTP 2020:36:168

The third comparison is distinguishing Indonesia tourism planning for the next 2025 and Malaysia tourism planning for the next 2020. Due to the geographic location of

Indonesia, the development of tourism in Indonesia should be based on the principles of tourism that protect and conserve the environment and considering the natural, social, economic and cultural sustainability. National Tourism Master plan 2010-2015 has encompassed the strategy into seven special-interest tourism which are historical and cultural tourism, natural and ecotourism, culinary and shopping tourism, Meeting-Incentive-Conference-Events (MICE), recreational sport tourism (i.e. golf, diving, cycling and hiking), cruise and yacht, as well as health and fitness tourism. The government targeted to reach 20 million foreign visitors by 2025.⁴²

The master plan was prioritized from 88 National Tourism Destinations into 16 Strategic National Tourism Areas with diverse destinations across Indonesia which intended to increase the sustainable and responsible tourism. There are Toba (North Sumatra), Seribu Islands (Jakarta), Kota Tua, Sunda Kelapa (Jakarta), Borobudur (Central Java and Yogyakarta D.I.), Bromo - Tengger - Semeru (East Java), Kintamani- Batur Lake (Bali), Menjangan, Pemuteran (Bali), Kuta, Sanur, Nusa Dua (Bali), Rinjani (West Nusa Tenggara), Komodo Island (East Nusa Tenggara), Ende - Flores (East Nusa Tenggara), Tanjung Putting (Central Kalimantan), Toraja (South Sulawesi), Bunaken (North Sulawesi), Wakatobi (Southeast Sulawesi), and Raja Ampat (West Papua).⁴³ Toba Lake and Batur are categorized as Geotourism. While Seribu Islands, Menjangan, Kuta-Sanur, Nusa Dua, Bunaken, Wakatobi, and Raja Ampat are classified into marine tourism. Kota Tua, Borobudur, and Toraja are developed as cultural and heritage are. Then, Bromo - Tengger - Semeru, Rinjani, Komodo, Ende - Flores, and Tanjung Putting are considered as ecotourism sites. There are some strategies that written in this plan which aim to support the implementation of natural attraction in Indonesia.

While, Malaysia has Malaysia Tourism Master Plan (MTTP) 2020:36:168 that consist of Malaysia tourism target by 2020. The transformation plan focuses on attracting high class tourists to Malaysia through several themes of tourism. Malaysia has targeted their tourism industry to reach 36 million tourist arrival with 168 billion tourists receipt per week by 2020. To achieve these growth ambition, the Ministry of Tourism has identified five themes of tourism which become a concern for the next ten years which are Affordable Luxury; Shopping; Nature Adventure; Family; Events, Entertainment, Spa and Sport; as well as

⁴² Andayani, Fitria. (2012). *Pemerintah Targetkan 20 Juta Wisman 2025*. Retrieved from <http://www.republika.co.id/berita/ekonomi/bisnis/12/12/09/mequ10-pemerintah-targetkan-20-juta-wisman-2025>

⁴³Government of Indonesia. (2010). *Lampiran Kawasan Strategis Pariwisata Nasional dalam RIPPARNAS*. Retrieved from <http://www.kemepar.go.id/asp/detil.asp?c=16&id=1949>

Business Tourism.⁴⁴ At the same time, it is combined with the trade and investment industries such as arts, festivals, parks and garden tourism, eco packages, highlands as well as their proud UNESCO sites-Malacca and Penang.⁴⁵

Another strategy is by further promoting the “Malaysia My Second Home, MM2H” scheme to potential foreigners. YBhg. Dato’ Dr. Ong Hong Peng, the Secretary General of Ministry of Tourism, has delivered the explanation towards the Malaysia Tourism Transformation Plan during a Dinner Talk with Head of Mission (HOM) Institute of Diplomacy and Foreign Affairs of Ministry of Foreign Affairs in the middle of 2011. He said that tourism is an important industry in Malaysia and is the second Foreign Exchange Earner, with its deep and wide linkages with other industries such as hotels, F&B, wellness, transportation, construction, entertainment, financial as well as agriculture has surpassed in creating national income and job opportunities.⁴⁶ The Ministry of Tourism was hoped that Head of Mission from Institute of Diplomacy and Foreign Affairs of Ministry of Foreign Affairs can help promote and elevate Malaysia tourism industry in overseas.

V. DOMESTIC AND INTERNATIONAL PROMOTION BOARD

As the fourth comparison, we have found that both countries possess domestic and international promotion board. Until this date, the number of tourism bodies in overseas Indonesia are still far away from the number of tourism bodies in Malaysia. It is happened because Malaysia already concerned on this issue since 1992 while Indonesia has just established the tourism bodies in abroad by 2005. That is why Indonesia barely opened the representative office, named VITO, in 13 different countries in the world.⁴⁷ To support the promotion activity in domestic area, Ministry of Tourism has been reactivated ITPB in 2011 by Mr. Jero Wacik. ITPB will focus on three main strategies (low season, creative economy, and green tourism) in attempt to boost tourism development in Indonesia.⁴⁸ Firstly,

⁴⁴ Government of Malaysia. (2011). *Malaysia Tourism Transformation Plan 2020*. Retrieved from http://dtxtq4w60xqpw.cloudfront.net/sites/all/files/pdf/malaysia_1.pdf

⁴⁵ Institute of Diplomacy & Foreign Relations (IDFR), Ministry of Foreign Affairs. (2011). *Dinner Talk: Malaysia Tourism Transformation Plan*. Retrieved from <http://www.idfr.gov.my/en/news-more-2/521-dinner-talk-malaysia-tourism-transformation-plan>

⁴⁶ Ibid

⁴⁷ Australia, China (Beijing and Guangzhou), France, Germany, India, Japan, Malaysia, UEA (The center of Middle East office), Netherland, South Korea, Russia, Singapore, United Kingdom.

⁴⁸ Syafputri, Ella. (2012). *Badan promosi pariwisata Indonesia fokus tiga strategi*. Retrieved from <http://www.antaranews.com/berita/309989/badan-promosi-pariwisata-indonesia-fokus-tiga-strategi>

Indonesia is concentrating its strategy upon VITO to promote the new regulations towards visa exemption and entry permit for sailing boat. Until recently many western tourists had to pay \$35 on arrival in Indonesia for a visa.⁴⁹ Indonesia government has officially announced that foreign people from 45 countries⁵⁰ were free for visa.⁵¹ The visa is only applied for several purposes such as governmental, educational, social, cultural, tourism, business, family, journalism, or stop by to continue the journey to another country.⁵² The validity period is within 30 days and cannot be extended. Until this date, there are 169 countries that already state officially to have visa free entry to Indonesia.⁵³ While Malaysia only applied visa free for 127 countries in the world.⁵⁴ By the application of visa-free initiative, it is intended to convince foreign visitors to buy more Indonesian goods in attempt to boost the value of the rupiah.⁵⁵ In this regards, the government has already facilitated foreign people to travelling in Indonesia, then they should be confidence to attract an abundance of tourists' arrival from abroad and gain a huge amount of money that will be spent during their visit.

Then, the second strategy that has to be promoted by VITO is deal with cruise and yacht especially in terms of permission system. This strategy is in line with the strategy that listed in MP3I which is improving the facilities and services of the existing harbors and marines (cruise and yacht) to adjust with international standard. Indonesia plans to ease the processes involved in the issuance of entry permits for foreign-owned yachts, to boost the yachting tourism sector by adopting an online system of issuing permits known as the Clearance Approval for Indonesian Territory (CAIT Online) with take only two hours to

⁴⁹ Vaswani, .Karishma. (2015). *Indonesia's weakening rupiah challenges government*. Retrieved from <http://www.bbc.com/news/business-32357063>

⁵⁰ RRC, Rusia, Korea Selatan, Jepang, Amerika Serikat, Kanada, Selandia Baru, Meksiko, Inggris, Jerman Perancis, Belanda, Italia, Spanyol, Swiss, Belgia, Swedia, Austria, Denmark, Norwegia, Finlandia, Polandia, Hungaria, Ceko, Qatar, Uni Emirat Arab, Kuwait, Bahrain, Oman, Afrika Selatan, Thailand, Malaysia, Singapore, Brunei Darussalam, the Philippines, Chile, Morocco, Peru, Vietnam, Ecuador, Cambodia, Laos, Myanmar, Hong Kong and Macao.

⁵¹ Humas. (2015). *Resmi, Wisatawan Dari 45 Negara Ini Bebas Visa Kunjungan Wisata Ke Indonesia*. Retrieved from <http://setkab.go.id/resmi-wisatawan-dari-45-negara-ini-bebas-visa-kunjungan-wisata-ke-indonesia/>

⁵² Government of Indonesia. (2015). *Peraturan Presiden Nomor 104 Tahun 2015 Tentang Perubahan Peraturan Presiden No 69 Tahun 2015 Tentang Bebas Visa Kunjungan*. Retrieved from <http://www.kemlu.go.id/sydney/id/Documents/Peraturan/PERPRES%20NO%20104%20TAHUN%202015.pdf>

⁵³ Humas. (2016). *Wisatawan Dari 169 Negara Ini Bebas Visa Kunjungan ke Indonesia*. <http://setkab.go.id/tidak-untuk-jurnalistik-wisatawan-dari-169-negara-ini-bebas-visa-kunjungan-ke-indonesia/>

⁵⁴ Government of Malaysia. (2016). *Countries That Require Visa/Do Not Require Visa*. Retrieved from http://www.kln.gov.my/c/document_library/get_file?p_l_id=225808&folderId=231025&name=DLFE-1922.pdf

⁵⁵ Vaswani, Karishma. (2015). *Indonesia's weakening rupiah challenges government*. Retrieved from <http://www.bbc.com/news/business-32357063>

issue a permit and extend the stay permit for yachters from three months to six months.⁵⁶ Then allow domestic passengers to ride down in five ports in Indonesia; Belawan (Medan), Sekupang (Kepulauan Riau) Tanjung Priok (Jakarta), Tanjung Perak (Surabaya), Bena (Bali) and Soekarno - Hatta (Makassar).⁵⁷ The third strategy of VITO is focusing on conducting a massive promotion activity in Singapore due to around 15 million foreign tourists and 4 million foreign workers are visiting Singapore every day.⁵⁸ So, Indonesia will optimize this opportunity to spread and distribute the marketing and promotion activity by selecting Singapore as the main target.

Meanwhile, Malaysia has already started their establishment of tourism promotion board in abroad since it was stated through the Tourism Development Corporation of Malaysia (TDC) was formed on 10th August 1972. Malaysia only has one promotional board which cover all the promotion activity both in domestic and in overseas.⁵⁹ Malaysia Tourism Promotion Board or known as Tourism Malaysia has opened the office in 31 different countries in the world.⁶⁰ Tourism Malaysia has classified their strategy into several programs which are in line with the general strategy made by the government agency, there are Shopping, Birding, Golfing, Cruise, Diving, Angling, Yachting, Bike Tourism, Wedding & Honeymoon, and Homestay.⁶¹

Currently, Malaysia has a total of seven major Federal ports namely Port Klang, Johor Port, Port of Tanjung Pelepas, Kuantan Port, Penang Port, Bintulu Port and Kemaman Port.⁶² Therefore, Malaysia can conduct or participate in such an international event of cruise or yacht because they already have a readiness in terms of facilities and infrastructure. While Indonesia still busy in improving the quality and quantity of facilities and infrastructure for

⁵⁶ Wicaksono, Aditya E. S. (2015). *Indonesia to ease entry permit procedures for foreign yachts*. Retrieved from <http://www.antaranews.com/en/news/97699/indonesia-to-ease-entry-permit-procedures-for-foreign-yachts>

⁵⁷ Government of Indonesia. (2016). *Siaran Pers Kunjungan Wisman 2015 Lampau Target*. Retrieved from <http://www.kemenpar.go.id/asp/detil.asp?c=16&id=3101>

⁵⁸ Ruslan, Heri. (2015). *Kemenpar Perkuat Strategi Branding Wonderful Indonesia*. Retrieved from <http://nasional.republika.co.id/berita/nasional/umum/15/11/30/nymhh6372-kemenpar-perkuat-strategi-branding-wonderful-indonesia>

⁵⁹ Tourism Malaysia. (2015). *About Tourism Malaysia*. Retrieved from <http://www.tourism.gov.my/about-us/about-tourism-malaysia>

⁶⁰ Australia, Brunei Darussalam, China (Beijing, Guangzhou, and Shanghai), France, Germany, Hong Kong, India (Mumbai, New Delhi, and Chennai), Indonesia (Jakarta and Medan), Italy, Japan, Saudi Arabia, Netherland, New Zealand, Philippines, Kazakhstan, South Korea, Russia, Singapore, South Africa, Sweden, Taiwan, Thailand, Turkey, UEA, United Kingdom, United States (Los Angles and New York), Vietnam, Bangladesh, Cambodia, Canada, Ireland, Iran, Laos.

⁶¹ Tourism Malaysia. (2015). *Niche Products*. Retrieved from <http://www.tourism.gov.my/niche>

⁶² Government of Malaysia. (2015). *Port in Malaysia*. Retrieved from <http://www.mot.gov.my/en/maritime/ports-in-malaysia/development-and-administration-of-ports>

the international ports. PT Pelindo has prioritize to construct three ports in Indonesia, which are Tanjung Perak in Surabaya, Tanjung Mas in Semarang, and Benoa in Bali since 2012 and it was expected to finish in 2014.⁶³ But in fact, according to the statement of Managing Director Asia Indonesia Cruise Sediya Yasa, there are still inadequate infrastructure and facilities such the depths of the ocean to provide a sufficient space turnaround or unloading passengers.⁶⁴ Until to this date, Indonesia still facing a problem in promoting Indonesia as a cruise or even yacht tourism destination for international level. Benoa port in Bali had requested as it was since 2012, but until now it has not happened yet, whereas Benoa port can be used as the point of a cruise ship to turn around and then it will give a big contribution towards the number of tourist arrivals.

Indonesia should be more aware of their potentials as the largest archipelago country in the world with more than 17000 island because if it can be seen from our finding, Indonesia still not capable to manage all the resources they have. Yet, the latest government seems very concern on tourism industry and start doing great promotions and development. We may perceive that the massive promotional effort by Malaysia has led to a great impact towards especially in economic development. The latest Minister of Tourism Indonesia, Arief Yahya, has stated that Malaysia tourism has budgeted nearly US \$ 300 million or equivalent to Rp 3.6 trillion, while Indonesia's budget allocation has set to Rp1.2 trillion which still considered as far from enough to boost tourism promotion Indonesia and reach the target.⁶⁵ It clearly seen why Indonesia still left behind Malaysia even though Indonesia's rank on natural and cultural resources is upon Malaysia⁶⁶, but the effort in promoting its potential is still beneath Malaysia.

VI. CONCLUSION

⁶³ Government of Indonesia. (2013). Indonesia Siap Jadi Destinasi Kapal Pesiar. Retrieved from <http://www2.pelindo.co.id/indonesia-siap-jadi-destinasi-kapal-pesiar>

⁶⁴ Wahyuni, Tri. (2016). Indonesia Masih Minim Fasilitas Wisata Kapal Pesiar. Retrieved from <http://www.cnnindonesia.com/gaya-hidup/20160108121832-269-102998/indonesia-masih-minim-fasilitas-wisata-kapal-pesiar/>

⁶⁵ Hasibuan, Noor Aspasia. (2015). *Anggaran Naik 4 Kali Lipat, Menteri Pariwisata Masih Tak Puas*. Retrieved from <http://www.cnnindonesia.com/ekonomi/20150205193914-92-30009/anggaran-naik-4-kali-lipat-menteri-pariwisata-masih-tak-puas/>

⁶⁶World Economic Forum. (2015). *The Travel & Tourism Competitiveness Report 2015*. Retrieved from http://www3.weforum.org/docs/TT15/WEF_Global_Travel&Tourism_Report_2015.pdf

Tourism industry is kind of an effective way to promote a country image by strengthening on public diplomacy implementation through several efforts. Indonesia with Wonderful Indonesia tagline has successfully experienced a sustainable growth in terms of number of tourists since 2010 to 2015. The Minister believes that by attracting tourists from Singapore, it will dramatically boost foreign tourists to come via Sekupang Port in Batam, Kepulauan Riau. It has no doubt that Indonesia has a plentiful of tourism attractions rather than Malaysia. So, it is hoped that foreign tourists, especially from western which automatically take a holiday package to ASEAN countries for more than ten days, will spend much time in Indonesia because Indonesia provides an abundant tourism attractions. But then, it is proved by the significant increase of foreign tourists which reaches its highest number for over ten million visitors by 2015. Thus, the massive promotion will still pointed to Singapore as the main target. In this regard, Indonesia is now deliberating a significant growth in tourism industry as effort to improve country image. The more visitors coming, the more its increase Indonesia image. However, Malaysia with Malaysia Truly Asia has gained its highest number of foreign visitors in 2014. But unfortunately, in 2015, Malaysia has experienced an unstable political condition which impacted to the degradation of foreign tourists arrivals. In this regard, the political conditions are really impacted to the tourism development in attracting foreign tourists. Yet, overall, Malaysia seems more prepare and fastest than Indonesia in spreading the brand to the worldwide. We sum up that based on a comparative study between Indonesia and Malaysia tourism strategy, a number of human resources, natural resources, or even potentials do not determine that a country can gain much economic and political benefit. This paper has compared that Malaysia has less human resources, natural resources as well as tourism potentials than Indonesia. But tourism Malaysia is more develop by gaining 27 million foreign tourists arrivals in 2014, doubled from Indonesia. Potentials and performances are two different things that should integrate each other in order to achieve a sustainable tourism growth.

References

Andayani, Fitria. (2012). *Pemerintah Targetkan 20 Juta Wisman 2025*. Retrieved from <http://www.republika.co.id/berita/ekonomi/bisnis/12/12/09/mequ10-pemerintah-targetkan-20-juta-wisman-2025>

Asdhiana, I Made. (2011). *“Wonderful Indonesia” Mulai Dipromosikan*. Retrieved from <http://travel.kompas.com/read/2011/01/06/15410311/Wonderful.Indonesia.Mulai.Dipromosikan>

Government of Indonesia. (2010). *Lampiran Kawasan Strategis Pariwisata Nasional dalam RIPPARNAS*. Retrieved from <http://www.kemenpar.go.id/asp/detil.asp?c=16&id=1949>

Government of Indonesia. (2011). *Indonesia Master Plan Acceleration and Expansion of Indonesia Economic Development 2011-2025*.

Government of Indonesia. (2013). *Indonesia Siap Jadi Destinasi Kapal Pesiar*. Retrieved from <http://www2.pelindo.co.id/indonesia-siap-jadi-destinasi-kapal-pesiar>

Government of Indonesia. (2015). *Peraturan Presiden Nomor 104 Tahun 2015 Tentang Perubahan Peraturan Presiden No 69 Tahun 2015 Tentang Bebas Visa Kunjungan*. Retrieved from <http://www.kemlu.go.id/sydney/id/Documents/Peraturan/PERPRES%20NO%20104%20TAHUN%202015.pdf>

Government of Indonesia. (2016). *Siaran Pers Kunjungan Wisman 2015 Lampau Target*. Retrieved from <http://www.kemenpar.go.id/asp/detil.asp?c=16&id=3101>

Government of Malaysia. (2010). *10th Malaysia Plan*. Retrieved from https://www.pmo.gov.my/dokumenattached/RMK/RMK10_Eds.pdf

Government of Malaysia. (2010). *New Economic Model: Part I: Strategic Policy Directions*. Retrieved from <http://www.epu.gov.my/epu-theme/pdf/nem.pdf>

Government of Malaysia. (2010). *New Economic Model: Part I: Strategic Policy Directions*. Retrieved from <http://www.epu.gov.my/epu-theme/pdf/nem.pdf>

Government of Malaysia. (2010). *New Economic Model: Part I: Strategic Policy Directions*. Pg 94. Retrieved from <http://www.epu.gov.my/epu-theme/pdf/nem.pdf>

Government of Malaysia. (2010). *Overview of ETP*. Retrieved from http://etp.pemandu.gov.my/About_ETP-@-Overview_of_ETP.aspx

Government of Malaysia. (2011). *Malaysia Tourism Transformation Plan 2020*. Retrieved from http://dtxtq4w60xqpw.cloudfront.net/sites/all/files/pdf/malaysia_1.pdf

Government of Malaysia. (2011). *National Economic Model*. Retrieved from <http://www.epu.gov.my/epu-theme/pdf/nem.pdf>

Government of Malaysia. (2011). Tenth Malaysia Plan. Retrieved from https://www.pmo.gov.my/dokumenattached/RMK/RMK10_Eds.pdf

Government of Malaysia. (2013). *Overview of ETP*. Retrieved from http://etp.pemandu.gov.my/About_ETP-@-Overview_of_ETP.aspx

Government of Malaysia. (2013). *Tourism & Travel Related Services*. Retrieved from <http://myservices.miti.gov.my/web/guest/tourism-travel-related>

Government of Malaysia. (2013). *What Is The Government Transformation Programme (GTP)?* Retrieved from <http://www.epu.gov.my/en/goverment-transformation-programme>

Government of Malaysia. (2015). *Port in Malaysia*. Retrieved from <http://www.mot.gov.my/en/maritime/ports-in-malaysia/development-and-administration-of-ports>

Government of Malaysia. (2016). *Countries That Require Visa/Do Not Require Visa*. Retrieved from http://www.kln.gov.my/c/document_library/get_file?p_1_id=225808&folderId=231025&name=DLFE-1922.pdf

Gumelar, Galih. (2015). *Menhub Akui Banyak Habiskan Anggaran untuk Bandara-Pelabuhan*. Retrieved from <http://www.cnnindonesia.com/ekonomi/20151020202437-78-86196/menhub-akui-banyak-habiskan-anggaran-untuk-bandara-pelabuhan/>

Hasibuan, Noor Aspasia. (2015). *Anggaran Naik 4 Kali Lipat, Menteri Pariwisata Masih Tak Puas*. Retrieved from <http://www.cnnindonesia.com/ekonomi/20150205193914-92-30009/anggaran-naik-4-kali-lipat-menteri-pariwisata-masih-tak-puas/>

Humas. (2015). *Resmi, Wisatawan Dari 45 Negara Ini Bebas Visa Kunjungan Wisata Ke Indonesia*. Retrieved from <http://setkab.go.id/resmi-wisatawan-dari-45-negara-ini-bebas-visa-kunjungan-wisata-ke-indonesia/>

Humas. (2016). *Wisatawan Dari 169 Negara Ini Bebas Visa Kunjungan ke Indonesia*. <http://setkab.go.id/tidak-untuk-jurnalistik-wisatawan-dari-169-negara-ini-bebas-visa-kunjungan-ke-indonesia/>

Institute of Diplomacy & Foreign Relations (IDFR), Ministry of Foreign Affairs. (2011). *Dinner Talk: Malaysia Tourism Transformation Plan*. Retrieved from <http://www.idfr.gov.my/en/news-more-2/521-dinner-talk-malaysia-tourism-transformation-plan>

Malaysian Green Technology Corporation. 2012. *Green Technology Financing Scheme (GTFS)*. Retrieved from <https://www.gtfs.my/news/green-technology-financing-scheme-gtfs>

Mohsen, Ahmar Shah. (2015). *Tourism industry now 6th largest GDP contributor, says Najib*. Retrieved from <http://www.thesundaily.my/news/1586311>

Ruslan, Heri. (2015). *Kemenpar Perkuat Strategi Branding Wonderful Indonesia*. Retrieved from <http://nasional.republika.co.id/berita/nasional/umum/15/11/30/nymhh6372-kemenpar-perkuat-strategi-branding-wonderful-indonesia>

Syafputri, Ella. (2012). *Badan promosi pariwisata Indonesia fokus tiga strategi*. Retrieved from <http://www.antaranews.com/berita/309989/badan-promosi-pariwisata-indonesia-fokus-tiga-strategi>

Tourism Malaysia. (2015). *About Tourism Malaysia*. Retrieved from <http://www.tourism.gov.my/about-us/about-tourism-malaysia>

Tourism Malaysia. (2015). *Niche Products*. Retrieved from <http://www.tourism.gov.my/niche>

UNWTO. (2011). *Tourism towards 2030*. Retrieved from <http://dtxtq4w60xqpw.cloudfront.net/sites/all/files/docpdf/atconf6-wp065en.pdf>

UNWTO. (2014). *UNWTO Tourism Highlight: 2014 edition*. Retrieved from <http://www.e-unwto.org/doi/pdf/10.18111/9789284416226>

UNWTO. (2015). *Why Tourism?* Retrieved from <http://www2.unwto.org/content/why-tourism>

Vaswani, Karishma. (2015). *Indonesia's weakening rupiah challenges government*. Retrieved from <http://www.bbc.com/news/business-32357063>

Wahyuni, Tri. (2016). *Indonesia Masih Minim Fasilitas Wisata Kapal Pesiar*. Retrieved from <http://www.cnnindonesia.com/gaya-hidup/20160108121832-269-102998/indonesia-masih-minim-fasilitas-wisata-kapal-pesiar/>

Wicaksono, Aditya E. S. (2015). *Indonesia to ease entry permit procedures for foreign yachts*. Retrieved from <http://www.antaraneews.com/en/news/97699/indonesia-to-ease-entry-permit-procedures-for-foreign-yachts>

World Economic Forum. (2015). *The Travel & Tourism Competitiveness Report 2015*. Retrieved from http://www3.weforum.org/docs/TT15/WEF_Global_Travel&Tourism_Report_2015.pdf

World Travel and Tourism Council. (2015). *Travel & Tourism Economic Impact 2015 Indonesia*. Retrieved from <https://www.wttc.org/-/media/files/reports/economic%20impact%20research/countries%202015/indonesia2015.pdf>